Xenophobia, Crime or Violent Entrepreneurship?

Analysing patterns of violence against Spaza shops in Cape Town & Johannesburg

Laurence Piper, UWC & Andrew Charman, Sustainable Livelihoods Foundation
58 000 Somali refugees in SA and 200 000 awaiting refugee status (LHR)

Many run Spaza shops in townships & history of attacks against, in Cape Town, Gauteng and NM Metro

Often explained in reference to the xenophobia

June 3rd 2013: Somalia Prime Minister Abdi Farah Shirdon called for South African President Jacob Zuma to take urgent action to prevent more violence against the Somali business community in South Africa (http://www.voanews.com/content/somalia-calls-on-south-africa-to-protect-immigrants/1674205.html)
Some reasons to question the common view:

(i) Xenophobic attitudes do not simply correlate to violent attacks (Afrikaans speaking DA supporters report higher levels of xenophobia than ANC supporters, yet most attacks in the poor, black areas)(Crush 2009, Fauvelle-Aymar and Segatti 2011)

(ii) Evidence of a history of price competition between Somali and South African spaza keepers in CCT (Charman, Petersen & Piper 2012) linked to nature and scale of business networks (Liedeman 2013) that has seen Somalis triumph

Thus: alternative possible reasons for violence include (ii) crime and (iii) ‘violent entrepreneurship’ or business competition
SLF’s FIME project looks to conduct census of micro-entreprises in townships in three main cities.

Offers access to a unique data set of interviews with 694 spaza shopkeepers from 7 townships/informal settlements in Cape Town and Johannesburg (Durban forthcoming – take us to 820)

Interviews probe history of crime and violence against the shop in the preceding 5 years

This enable us to test for different rates of crime and violence by nationality and business characteristics
Go down every street; identify and geolocate every business; interview shopkeepers of the main types (shebeens, spazas, haircare, and educare)

Capture survey data

Generate business maps
Sites – Cape Town

Formalising Informal Micro-Enterprises Project: Research and Engagement sites

Map showing sites such as Sweet Home Farm, Delft South, Browns Farm, Imizamo Yethu, Seawinds/Vrygrond.
Formalising Informal Micro-Enterprises Project:
Research and Engagement sites

Sites – Gauteng

[Map showing sites in Gauteng region]
Business Maps

Distribution of micro-enterprises by enterprise category
Browns Farm and Hazeldean Estate, Philippi, November 2011

Map legend
Enterprise category and count of enterprises
- Shebeen 286
- House shop 213
- Spaza 135
- Hair care 132
- Take aways 110
- Green grocer 70
- Place of worship 60
- Mechanical/electrical 54
- Building services 50
- Community resources 48
- Trade 48
- Recycling 46
- Transport 43
- Educare 42
- Health service 39
- Tailoring and cobbler 36
- Phone shop 33
- Car wash 22
- Business services 21
- Butcher shop 17
- House stand 14
- Manufacture 14
- Personal services 14
- Agriculture 9
- Food retail 7
- Tavern 6
- Drug dealer 5
- Restaurant 3
- Entertainment 3
- Accommodation 2
- Game shop 2
- Artist 1
- Wetland 1
- Wholesaler 1
Spaza Maps (by nationality)

Spaza shops showing the relative distribution of foreign vs South African owned spaza shops: Browns Farm and Hazeldean Estate, Philippi, November 2011

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Demographic variable</th>
<th>Data</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total households</td>
<td>14,004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estimated total population</td>
<td>70,023</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage population Black</td>
<td>94.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage population Coloured</td>
<td>5.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployed population (of working age)</td>
<td>65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monthly income per capita</td>
<td>R808</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: All data is derived from a combination of Census 2001, Community Survey 2007 and internal research.

Map legend
Spaza Ownership
- Foreign (58)
- South African (106)
- Closed (21)
Number of Spazas = 694

- Sweet Home Farm: 22
- Brown's Farm: 111
- Delft/Eindhoven: 108
- Vrygrond: 58
- Ivory Park: 216
- Thembisa: 120
- Y: 59
Any Crime Incident Last 5 Years

- Incident: 317
- No Incident: 377
All Incidents by Nationality over 5 years

- Somali: 58.70%
- Bangladesh: 54.50%
- Ethiopian: 41.40%
- South African: 40.80%
- Zim: 34.60%
Incident Frequency in Years

- SWF: 7.3
- Somali: 8.5
- Delft: 8.8
- Brown's Farm: 9.1
- Average: 9.1
- Bangladesh: 9.2
- IY: 10.2
- Ethiopian: 12.1
- South African: 12.3
- Ivory Park: 12.6
- Thembisa: 13.1
- Zim: 14.5
- Vrygrond: 15.2
Murder

- Experienced incident: 11, 2%
- No incidents: 683, 98%
Murder by Nationality

- South African: 3
- Somali: 8
- Bangladeshi: 8
- Zimbabwean: 0
- Ethiopian: 0
- Mozambican: 0
- Other: 0
Spaza Murder vs National Average

Murder rate per 100000

- National average: 30.9
- Spaza average: 317
- South African: 230
- Somali: 1310
Arson

South African
Somalian
Bangladeshi
Zimbabwean
Ethiopian
Mozambican
Other

8%
Harrassmement

- South African: 9.2%
- Somali: 21.0%
- Bangladeshi: 20.5%
- Zimbabwean: 11.5%
- Ethiopian: 4.7%
- Mozambican: 13.0%
- Other: 13.0%
Key patterns: Spaza Violence

- Spaza’s will experience one violent crime every ten years: 12 years 3 months for a South African; 8 years six months for a Somali and 7 years six months in a slum.
- The poorer the area, the more dangerous for Spazas.
- Murder rate = 10 times national average for Spazas, 40 times for Somali shopkeepers.
- South African shopkeepers experience more theft, Somali and Bang experience more armed robbery.
- Somali experience more assault, Bang more arson, both experience more harassment.
- Somalis in CCT most similar to Bang in Gauteng.
Running a spaza business is risky, that increases with poverty of area. It is worse for Somali and Bang than other groups. Safest = Zimbabwean in a better-off area like Imizamo Yethu.

The division is not simply SA vs foreign, but vs particular groups. In CCT against the largest group, Somalis, but in Gauteng less clear – not clearly against Ethiopians but Bang

Experience of violence not simply xenophobic, but is it just ‘Somali-phobic’ then? And perhaps ‘Bang-phobic’?

Interrogate Somali case more as the strongest one...
Somali’s are disproportionately targeted – about 50% more than South Africans. Is this because of prejudice?

- Somalis poorly integrated into SA communities (Gastrow 2013, Liedeman 2013) – this view suggested by harassment stats – 20% for Somali to SA 9%

But others also matter – the most important are general levels of crime against all spazas (Somali 59% to 47% SA)

- Plus, Somalis live in shops – might explain theft vs armed robbery
- Plus Somalis run more successful spazas. More successful shebeens = higher crime (see next slide). Assume the same for spazas

- Plus know of significance of ‘violent entrepreneurship’ in each site
- We hypothesise that crime causes most variation, with prejudice and business competition lesser variables
% OF SURVEYED BUSINESSES IN CATEGORY

- LOW VOLUME TRADERS
- MEDIUM VOLUME TRADERS
- HIGH VOLUME TRADERS

ARMED ROBBERY IN BROWN'S FARM SHEBEENS 2007-2011
(239 cases)
1. Do not confuse xenophobic attacks on Somalis in townships (most of whom in Spaza shops) with crimes against Spaza shops, many of which are run by Somalis.
   - Pogroms involve popular mobilisation and target outsiders explicitly. This clearly happens and usually documented in media and by NGOs.

2. Most violence against Spazas is not pogrom, but criminal.

3. However, prejudice against particularly groups (Somali and Bang) probably exacerbates some kinds of violence (harassment), but not primary cause of most.

4. Violent entrepreneurship also important, but also secondary.